



### **SELECTED TECHNICAL PAPERS**

#### STP1620

Editors: Nima Shamsaei, Steve Daniewicz, Nik Hrabe, Stefano Beretta, Jess Waller, and Mohsen Seifi

# Structural Integrity of Additive Manufactured Parts

ASTM STOCK #STP1620 DOI: 10.1520/STP1620-EB

#### Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Shamsaei, Nima, editor. | ASTM International, issuing body.

Title: Structural integrity of additive manufactured parts / editors, Nima
Shamsaei, Steve Daniewicz, Nik Hrabe, Stefano Beretta, Jess Waller,

Mohsen Seifi.

Description: West Conshohocken, PA: ASTM International, 2020. | Series:

Selected technical papers; STP1620 | Includes bibliographical

references. | Summary: "This compilation of Selected Technical Papers,

STP1620, Structural Integrity of Additive Manufactured Parts, contains

peer-reviewed papers that were presented at a symposium held November

6-8, 2018, in Washington, DC, USA. The symposium was sponsored by ASTM

International Committee F42 on Additive Manufacturing Technologies, with

co-sponsorship from Committees E08 on Fatigue and Fracture and E07 on

Nondestructive Testing"-- Provided by publisher.

Identifiers: LCCN 2019055470 (print) | LCCN 2019055471 (ebook) | ISBN

9780803176867 (paperback) | ISBN 9780803176874 (pdf)

Subjects: LCSH: Three-dimensional printing--Congresses. | Machine

parts--Testing--Congresses. | Machine parts--Design and

construction--Congresses.

Classification: LCC TS171.95 .S77 2020 (print) | LCC TS171.95 (ebook) |

DDC 621.9/88--dc23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2019055470

LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2019055471

ISBN: 978-0-8031-7686-7

Copyright © 2020 ASTM INTERNATIONAL, West Conshohocken, PA. All rights reserved. This material may not be reproduced or copied, in whole or in part, in any printed, mechanical, electronic, film, or other distribution and storage media, without the written consent of the publisher.

#### **Photocopy Rights**

Authorization to photocopy items for internal, personal, or educational classroom use, or the internal, personal, or educational classroom use of specific clients, is granted by ASTM International provided that the appropriate fee is paid to the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, Tel: (978) 646-2600; http://www.copyright.com/

ASTM International is not responsible, as a body, for the statements and opinions expressed in this publication. ASTM International does not endorse any products represented in this publication.

#### Peer Review Policy

Each paper published in this volume was evaluated by two peer reviewers and at least one editor. The authors addressed all of the reviewers' comments to the satisfaction of both the technical editor(s) and the ASTM International Committee on Publications.

The quality of the papers in this publication reflects not only the obvious efforts of the authors and the technical editor(s), but also the work of the peer reviewers. In keeping with long-standing publication practices, ASTM International maintains the anonymity of the peer reviewers. The ASTM International Committee on Publications acknowledges with appreciation their dedication and contribution of time and effort on behalf of ASTM International.

## Citation of Papers

When citing papers from this publication, the appropriate citation includes the paper authors, "paper title," in *STP title*, book editor(s) (West Conshohocken, PA: ASTM International, year), page range, paper doi, listed in the footnote of the paper. A citation is provided on page one of each paper.

Printed in Hanover, PA

May, 2020

# **Foreword**

THIS COMPILATION OF Selected Technical Papers, STP1620, Structural Integrity of Additive Manufactured Parts, contains peer-reviewed papers that were presented at a symposium held November 6–8, 2018, in Washington, DC, USA. The symposium was sponsored by ASTM International Committee F42 on Additive Manufacturing Technologies, with co-sponsorship from Committees E08 on Fatigue and Fracture and E07 on Nondestructive Testing.

Symposium Chairs and STP Editors:

Nima Shamsaei Auburn University Auburn, AL, USA

Steve Daniewicz The University of Alabama Tuscaloosa, AL, USA

Nik Hrabe National Institute of Standards and Technology Boulder, CO, USA

> Stefano Beretta Politecnico di Milano Milan, Italy

Jess Waller National Aeronautics and Space Administration, HX5 Las Cruces, NM, USA

> Mohsen Seifi ASTM International Washington, DC, USA

# Contents

Overview	ix
Metal Additive Manufacturing Defect Formation and Nondestructive  Evaluation Detectability  Ben Dutton, Wilson Vesga, Jess Waller, Steve James, and Mohsen Seifi	1
Evaluation of Nondestructive Volumetric Testing Methods for Additively Manufactured Parts	51
Anne-Françoise Obaton, Bryan Butsch, Stephen McDonough, Ewen Carcreff, Nans Laroche, Yves Gaillard, Jared B. Tarr, Patrick Bouvet, Rodolfo Cruz, and Alkan Donmez	
NDE-Based Quality Assurance of Metal Additively Manufactured Aerospace Parts at NASA, JAXA, and ESA  Jess M. Waller, Eric R. Burke, Douglas N. Wells, Charles T. Nichols, Ana D. Brandão, Johannes Gumpinger, Martin Born, Tommaso Ghidini, Tsuyoshi Nakagawa, Akio Koike, Masami Mitsui, and Tsuyoshi Itoh	92
Eddy Current Technologies for Real-Time Monitoring and Post-Process Examination of Laser Powder Bed Fusion Process Evgueni Iordanov Todorov	129
Nondestructive Evaluation of Additive Manufactured Parts Using Process Compensated Resonance Testing Richard A. Livings, Eric J. Biedermann, Chen Wang, Thomas Chung, Steven James, Jess M. Waller, Scott Volk, Ajay Krishnan, and Shane Collins	165
Nondestructive Evaluation of Programmed Defects in Ti-6Al-4V L-PBF ASTM E8-Compliant Dog-Bone Samples Jeong K. Na, John Middendorf, Michael Lander, Jess M. Waller, and Richard W. Rauser	206

Expression of Additive Manufacturing Surface Irregularities through	
a Flaw-Based Assessment	234
Johannes Gumpinger, Ana D. Brandão, Emilie Beevers,	
Thomas Rohr, Tommaso Ghidini, Stefano Beretta, and Simone Romano	
Development and Testing of 316L Stainless Steel Metal Additive Manufacturing	
Test Articles for Powder Bed Fusion and Directed Energy Deposition Processes	250
Jessica L. Coughlin, Trevor G. Hicks, Patrick S. Dougherty,	
and Steven A. Attanasio	
Effects of the Shielding Argon Gas Flow on the Mechanical and	
Physical Properties of Selective Laser Melted Ti-6Al-4V Solid Material	278
Oscar A. Quintana, Nia Hightower, and Robert Rybolt	
Influence of Intentionally Induced Porosity and Postprocessing Conditions	
on the Mechanical Properties of Laser Powder Bed-Fused Inconel 625	294
Jean-Rene Poulin, Morgan Letenneur, Patrick Terriault, and Vladimir Brailovski	
Elucidating the Impact of Processing Parameters of Additive Manufactured	
Materials Using Microscale Tensile Samples	313
Michael Duffy, Salahudin Nimer, Marc Zupan, and Steven Storck	
Additive Manufactured Polymer Test Coupons: Issues and Solutions	334
Rachael Andrulonis, Royal Lovingfoss, and John Tomblin	
Coupon-Level Mechanical Testing for Polymer-Based Additive Manufacturing	355
Chul Y. Park, Keith E. Rupel, Chelsey E. Henry, and Upul R. Palliyaguru	
Characterization of Stress Fields Near Pores and Application to Fatigue Lives	367
James C. Sobotka and R. Craig McClung	
Fatigue and Fracture Behavior of Additively Manufactured Austenitic Stainless Steel	381
Chris San Marchi, Thale R. Smith, Joshua D. Sugar, and Dorian K. Balch	
Fatigue Behavior of Laser Metal Deposited 17-4 PH Stainless Steel	399
Lakshmi J. Vendra, Anjani Achanta, and Eric Sullivan	
Fatigue Assessment of 17-4 PH Stainless Steel Notched Specimens Made	
by Direct Metal Laser Sintering	415
Filippo Berto, Ali Fatemi, Nima Shamsaei, and Seyed Mohammad Javad Razavi	
A Comparison of Stress Corrosion Cracking Susceptibility in	
Additively Manufactured Ti-6Al-4V for Biomedical Applications	423
Michael Roach, R. Scott Williamson, Jonathan Pegues, and Nima Shamsaei	
Fatigue Properties of Additive Manufactured Ti-6Al-4V and	
CoCr-Alloy Total Ankle Components	437
Dirk Scholvin, Doug Linton, David Tuttle, Ben Walters, Scott Bible,	
Jesse Fleming, and Jon Moseley	

Primary Processing Parameter Effects on Defects and Fatigue in Alloy 718  Luke Sheridan, Bo Whip, and Joy Gockel				
Role of Post-Fabrication Heat Treatment on the Low-Cycle Fatigue Behavior of Electron Beam Melted Inconel 718 Superalloy Thomas Wegener, Johannes Günther, Florian Brenne, and Thomas Niendorf	465			
An Efficient Test Method for the Quantification of Technology-Dependent Factors Affecting the Fatigue Behavior of Metallic Additive Manufacturing Components	484			
Gianni Nicoletto				
Probabilistic Computational Fatigue and Fracture Modeling of Additive Manufactured Components Robert G. Tryon, Robert McDaniels, Andrew Chern, Michael Oja, Animesh Dey, Ibrahim Awad, and Chad Duty	507			
Probabilistic Framework for Defect Tolerant Fatigue Assessment of Additively Manufactured Parts Applied to a Space Component Simone Romano, Stefano Beretta, Stefano Miccoli, and Michael Gschweitl	526			
Rapid Additive Qualification Using Probabilistics (RAQUP)  Genghis Khan, Natarajan Chennimalai Kumar, Liping Wang, Vipul Gupta, Voramon Dheeradhada, Tim Hanlon, Laura Dial, and Joseph Vinciquerra	540			
Performance Signature Qualification for Additively Manufactured Parts under Conditions Emulating In-Service Loading  John G. Michopoulos, John C. Steuben, Athanasios P. Iliopoulos,  Trung Nguyen, and Nam Phan	550			
NASA's Efforts for the Development of Standards for Additive Manufactured Components Richard Russell	573			

# Overview

To ensure the structural integrity of additively manufactured (AM) parts, it is critical to establish feedstock-process-structure-property-performance relationships, particularly where these components and structures are being used in safety-critical applications. ASTM International (ASTM), in coordination with partners from government, industry, and academia, has organized a series of annual symposia to help address these needs.

The 3rd ASTM Symposium on Structural Integrity of Additive Manufactured Parts—which took place from November 6–8, 2018, in Washington, DC—was designed to provide a forum for the exchange of ideas regarding the structural integrity of parts fabricated using AM, with a focus on the lack of industry standards and design principles, as well as qualification and certification challenges.

The event was co-sponsored by ASTM Committee F42 on Additive Manufacturing Technologies, along with Committees E08 on Fatigue and Fracture and E07 on Nondestructive Testing. It was supported by the ASTM Additive Manufacturing Center of Excellence (AM CoE), National Aeronautics and Space Administration (NASA), National Institute of Standards and Technology (NIST), European Structural Integrity Society (ESIS) TC15, and the U.S. National Congress for Theoretical and Applied Mechanics.

Approximately 250 people attended the 3-day event, representing 11 different nations around the world. The symposium included 56 talks by experts from industry, government, and academia, and 3 panel discussions, which covered nondestructive testing and the challenges of AM standardization and adoption in the medical device and aerospace industries.

The 27 selected technical papers in this collection provide an opportunity to delve more deeply into the wide variety of topics covered during the symposium. While individual papers often touch on multiple topics, the following list presents the major areas covered in the symposium and the papers that address each topic as their primary focus.

A significant emphasis of this symposium was on nondestructive evaluation and in situ monitoring of AM parts, and the below articles are in this category:

- Metal Additive Manufacturing Defect Formation and Nondestructive Evaluation (NDE) Detectability
- Evaluation of Nondestructive Volumetric Testing Methods for Additively Manufactured Parts

- NDE-Based Quality Assurance of Metal Additively Manufactured Aerospace Parts at NASA, JAXA, and ESA
- Eddy Current Technologies for Real-time Monitoring and Post Process Examination of Laser Powder Bed Fusion Process
- Nondestructive Evaluation of Additive Manufactured Parts Using Process Compensated Resonance Testing
- Nondestructive Evaluation of Programmed Defects in Ti-6Al-4V L-PBF ASTM E8-Compliant Dog-Bone Samples

As the lack of understanding and standardization to capture the structural integrity of AM parts is still a major roadblock against the adoption of AM in load-bearing, safety critical applications, many papers presented relating to fatigue, fracture, tensile, and corrosion behavior of materials and parts fabricated using AM were presented. Effects of design, process, and post-process parameters on fatigue and fracture properties as well as process optimization to improve structural integrity of AM parts were also discussed extensively. Applicability of existing mechanical test methods to AM parts and innovative approaches to standardization were emphasized in this symposium. The following papers focus on related topics for this category:

- Expression of Additive Manufacturing Surface Irregularities through a Flaw-Based Assessment
- Development and Testing of 316L Stainless Steel Metal Additive Manufacturing Test Articles for Powder Bed Fusion and Directed Energy Deposition Processes
- Effects of the Shielding Argon Gas Flow on the Mechanical and Physical Properties of Selective Laser Melted Ti-6Al-4V Solid Material
- Influence of Intentionally Induced Porosity and Postprocessing Conditions on the Mechanical Properties of Laser Powder Bed-Fused Inconel 625
- Elucidating the Impact of Processing Parameters of Additive Manufactured Materials Using Microscale Tensile Samples
- Additive Manufactured Polymer Test Coupons—Issues and Solutions
- Coupon-Level Mechanical Testing for Polymer Based Additive Manufacturing
- Characterization of Stress Fields Near Pores and Application to Fatigue Lives
- Fatigue and Fracture Behavior of Additively Manufactured Austenitic Stainless Steel
- Fatigue Behavior of Laser Metal Deposited 17-4 PH Stainless Steel
- Fatigue Assessment of 17-4 PH Stainless Steel Notched Specimens Made by Direct Metal Laser Sintering
- A Comparison of Stress Corrosion Cracking Susceptibility in Additively-Manufactured Ti-6Al-4V for Biomedical Applications
- Fatigue Properties of Additive Manufactured Ti-6Al-4V and CoCr-Alloy Total Ankle Components

- Primary Processing Parameter Effects on Defects and Fatigue in Alloy 718
- Role of Post-Fabrication Heat Treatment on the Low-Cycle Fatigue Behavior of Electron Beam Melted Inconel 718 Superalloy
- An Efficient Test Method for the Quantification of Technology-Dependent Factors Affecting the Fatigue Behavior of Metallic AM Components
- Probabilistic Computational Fatigue and Fracture Modeling of Additive Manufactured Components
- Probabilistic Framework for Defect Tolerant Fatigue Assessment of AM Parts Applied to a Space Component

Finally, recent advances in standardization, qualification and certification were presented:

- Rapid Additive Qualification Using Probabilistics (RAQUP)
- Performance Signature Qualification for Additively Manufactured Parts under Conditions Emulating In-Service Loading
- NASA's Efforts for the Development of Standards for Additive Manufactured Components

We would like to extend our gratitude to everyone who made this symposium possible. The hard work of the authors, coauthors, our symposium co-chairs and coeditors, peer reviewers, and personnel of ASTM and its AM CoE partners, as well as the support of NASA, NIST, ESIS TC15, and the U.S. National Congress for Theoretical and Applied Mechanics all played a major role in the success of the symposium and this publication.

Nima Shamsaei Mohsen Seifi STP Editors

ASTM INTERNATIONAL Helping our world work better

ISBN: 978-0-8031-7686-7 Stock #: STP1620

www.astm.org